



Investigating Human Rights Education in Curricula: A Comparative Content Analysis of 'O' Level Versus SSC English Textbooks

Jamshed Iqbal^{a*}, Dr. Riasat Ali^b

^aPhD Scholar, Department of Education, Abdul Wali Khan University, Mardan. ^bProfessor, Department of Education, Abdul Wali Khan University, Mardan

*Email: jamshed72iq@yahoo.com

Abstract: This study aimed to explore human rights concepts as mentioned in Universal Declaration of Human Rights as well as Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan in 'O' Level versus SSC in English Textbooks in Pakistan. The study was further focused specifically on exploring civil rights in the English Textbooks of both streams. This research study was based on research questions of how to investigate the main category; sub- categories; issues and directions of civil rights. The study was delimited to the English textbooks being taught in schools of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Population of the study consisted of all units and lessons of both streams of English Textbooks. Sample of the study was two lessons from each stream which was chosen conveniently and purposively. The researchers collected data through content analysis procedure by using the Model of Shukla (2011). Data were analyzed through frequency and percentage. It was found that civil rights [f= 39 with 81.25%] were more in SSC English Textbook in contrast to 'O' Level which was [f= 09 with 18.75%]. It was recommended that policy makers, curriculum designers and textbook boards in both streams of SSC versus 'O' Level need to give equal weightage to the main category, sub- categories and issues pertaining to civil rights in the Textbooks of English in order to inculcate awareness of human rights education among students.

Key Words: Civil rights; Curricula; English Textbooks; Secondary Schools; 'O' Level

1. Introduction

Research evidence brings testimony to the fait accompli that the subject of human rights (*hereafter to be considered as HR*) has grabbed the attention of researchers since the genesis of human life (Alhawamdeh, 2023; Damayanti et al., 2024) as it has become the most debatable area, pressing issue and hot topic across the globe (Rezeq, 2016; Damayanti et al., 2024). In fact, experts of HR have acknowledged unanimously that the most significant concepts that learners should be well- acquainted with are HR (Alhawamdeh, 2023); the protection of which has become the topmost priority by the United Nations (*throughout the paper, these terms will be used as UNO*) by all means (Karim, 2019) for this glaring fact cannot be gainsaid that understanding HR both in letter and spirit by the students contributes undeniably to the progress of society and enable them finding viable solutions to many of their problems (Bashir, 2016). The learners will promote justice and welfare in society; and will also be able to interact amicably with their peers be it is in schools, society and families (Bashir, 2016) if HR is inculcated in them on pragmatic footings. It is, therefore, imperative upon education systems to make the learners cognizant about their fundamental HR (Smith, 2021) in order to act as socially responsible and morally good human beings (Ahmad, 2018). On the contrary, it is ironical to bring to the limelight that HR has been featured with little attention in the

textbooks (De Kort, 2017).

Regarding the flagrant violation of HR, Pirzado (2022) in his research endeavor refers to the stunning reality that Pakistan stands at the very bottom line in human development index across the globe and is even dismally presenting disappointing scenario in education sector. The state of education in the country is suffering from inaccessibility and unavailability of quality education. While analyzing social studies textbook, (De Kort, 2017) has further found in her research study that the basic information of HR is scarcely found in the textbooks, irrespective of the fact that there is an ample opportunity to integrate the themes of human rights education (*to be referred as HRE subsequently*). It is indeed sorry state of affairs that the formal teaching of HR is yet to be included in curricula across schools in Pakistan. There is great lacuna of carrying out research inquiry in HRE in Pakistan (Pirzado, 2022). Consequently, every research endeavor to be carried out in English Textbooks in the context of global studies and HR is, henceforth, a vital step (Rezeq, 2022).

HR has been influencing the development of societies drastically and certainly reform societal affairs and can play key role for the betterment of citizens of the members of the communities (Alhawamdeh, 2022). Tehseem et al. (2020), therefore, have stressed upon the exigent need of promoting HRE in order to help the young generation become useful citizens to build peaceful social milieu. In the same vein, it has also been strongly argued by (Totten & Pedersen, 2011 as cited in Tehseem et al., 2020) that imparting HR through the medium of education can lead to effective learning of various desirable skills. Similarly, Kukovec (2017) also firmly believes that there is blatant violation of HR in abundance across the present world; nevertheless, HRE can be the best tool to preclude future violations as it inculcates in an individual to construct and disseminate widely acceptable HR culture. Likewise, researchers like (Tehseem et al., 2020) are of the view that focusing on HR in the discipline of education can certainly lead to the fact that education should promote the values of HR in learners.

Both language and HR are well-dovetailed and have got inseparable proximity. In other words, language is considered as the most powerful tool in imparting HR. Tehseem et al. (2020) have alluded in their recent study to the evidence that students should be imparted HR values through the learning of a language. Language has the capacity in constructing the ideologies and shaping our mind. Such type of education is of paramount significance for the learners to know what HR are and how they can practise them in their practical life. Hence, language learning has got cardinal role in the dissemination and propagation of HR values.

It is to be emphatically stated that the major importance of a textbook still in current digitalized era cannot be overlooked for it has an important role in conveying the concepts of HR to learners and promoting them (Alhawamdeh, 2023). A textbook is called as that book which is focused on a particular subject and being used in the teaching learning process in schools (Ahmad, 2018). In other words, as has been described by (Tyler, 2013, as cited in Ahmad, 2018), it is a formal manual used for the purpose of instruction in a particular subject in an educational institution. Examples of some key textbooks at secondary level as has been highlighted in his research project by (Ahmad, 2018) are English, Urdu, Islamiyat, and Pakistan Studies. According to Ahmad (2018) promoting social and moral values is one of the aims of social sciences and language textbooks. Likewise, in his impressive study of descriptive research, Alhawamdeh (2023) recommends that due importance needs to be given to HR concepts in the literary texts of Arabic language textbooks at secondary level in future editions by designers and curriculum developers under the Ministry of Education in Saudi Arabia. Therefore, the importance of including HR concepts in school language textbooks is the need of the hour ((Alhawamdeh, 2023). Hence, it can also be deduced from such recommendation that a comparative study of textbooks of English in both the streams of Secondary School Certificate (*in this article, the abbreviation SSC will be used to refer to the same*) and Ordinary Level (*hereafter to be read as 'O' Level*) needs to be taken up in order to explore the existence of HR concepts.

There are several studies in which comparative content analysis with reference to HR concepts and value education in two or more than two textbooks either similar or different in nature have been investigated. This glaring fact cannot be denied that all such studies are a valuable contribution theoretically, methodologically and practically to the emerging field of HRE. However, their geographical contexts, populations and samples, types of textbooks, levels of different grades in which the selected textbooks and their contents were selected; and period of time differ from each other. For example, Aslan and Karaman-Kepenekci (2008) compared some key HR issues in the textbooks. However, their study was restricted to mother tongue textbooks in Turkey and France only with few HR to freedom, democracy, justice, tolerance and peace only. Similarly, in another research a comparison between Turkish and Iranian social studies textbooks with specific reference to value education was undertaken by (Kaya, 2019). However, the research project was limited to just seventh-grade. Likewise, in her PhD thesis, Munir (2021) made an exhaustive attempt in making an in-depth analysis of comparing the curricula of SSC and HSSC with 'O'

and 'A' Levels with particular focus on global citizenship education. Although, the sample of her comparative content analysis was Urdu, English, Islamiyat, Pakistan Studies, History and Geography textbooks of both the streams, yet the scope of the study is delimited to the province of Punjab in Pakistan. Recently, Pirzado (2022) in his research dissertation studied HR elements through the lens of Universal Declaration of Human Rights (in this article, UDHR will be used) in Pakistani Curriculum. The researcher analyzed the constitution of Pakistan (*hereafter to be considered as CP*), education policy documents and the curriculum of social studies and Islamic studies. Most importantly, Pirzado (2022) in his study has grouped all the articles of UDHR in twelve different categories for curriculum intention, implementation, and experience in the Pakistani school systems. Although, the researcher took three different systems like government, autonomous and NGO based systems into consideration, however, his research project is restricted not only to the province of Sindh but also to the textbooks of social studies and Islamic studies only.

Furthermore, Uddin et al., (2023) compared UDHR with some of the key verses of the Holy Qur'an and Sunnah through content analysis which is yet another explicit evidence of exploring HR in key documents. However, their invaluable study was restricted merely to right to life in the UDHR. In addition, Alhawamdeh (2023) made an exhaustive research endeavor to identify the degree of inclusion of HR concepts in Arabic textbooks. Nonetheless, this particular study was limited to quantitative design in methodological approach and restricted just to Arabic textbooks at secondary level while investigating HR concepts through the prism of teachers' perceptions. In addition, it is also pertinent to highlight that Smith (2021) explored HR themes in social studies textbook being taught at lower secondary level in Sweden and England in his Master level research project. However, his research was primarily focused on investigating HR through the perspective of one of the most significant conventions termed as CRC (*Convention on the Rights of Child*) adopted in 1989 that came into existence after more than four decades of UDHR since 1948.

It is to further emphasize that an exhaustive critical analysis of the previous studies attempted by (Karim, 2029; Abu Al-Dabaat, 2019; Al- Omari & Ali, 2019) explicitly revealed that relatively less attention has been heeded to the concepts of HR in the contents and lessons in the textbooks particularly in the subject of English. Therefore, serious considerations have to be given to include them at the maximum for the learners. Nevertheless, the research study of Alhawamdeh (2023) has thrown up many questions in need of further investigation of similar classes and stages of educational processes and making an explicit comparison with findings of his study. Furthermore, previous literature has also stressed upon giving more reinforcement in transferring HR up to the maximum level to the learners. Ahmad (2018) strongly recommends the inclusion of moral and social values in the textbooks at secondary level for the wholesome education and holistic character grooming of the students. He has found in his study that textbooks have not only overlooked key social values of responsibility, universal brotherhood and unity but are also lacking in moral values of virtue, moderation and patience. In addition, making 'O' level students aware about the paramount importance of HR values, Ishfaq et al.(2014) have strongly recommended on giving emphasis to character building and moral values of the learners based on one of their findings that parents of 'O' and 'A' Level students complained about their disrespect to the elders. In the same way, Hemchand (2009, as cited in Ahmad, 2018) defined secondary education to be of those classes which are ninth and tenth level in Pakistan. Students during these two years of education are at the critical juncture of learning values and all sorts of skills effectively. Therefore, there is a need to carry out a novel study in exploring and comparing HR concepts in the textbooks of English language across SSC and 'O' Level streams being taught in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (*abbreviated as KP*) schools.

The purpose of this qualitative comparative content analytical study was to investigate HR concepts as enunciated in UDHR and CP in the textbooks of English at SSC and 'O' Level Cambridge University being taught in KP educational institutions. A qualitative comparative content analytical study was selected to generate deep understanding of key generations of HR and their significant existence in curricula at secondary schools level. It is significant to state that qualitative content analysis is applied as a research design for the systematic description of the qualitative written text. The main purpose behind this highly recommendable method as has been suggested by (Schreier, 2012) in his groundbreaking book, 'Qualitative Content Analysis in Practice' is to classify the selected text as examples of the categories in a typical coding structure. Nevertheless, this research task was intended to investigate the underlining implicit and explicit themes referring to civil rights in the textbooks of English in both the streams of SSC and 'O' Level education systems in the province of KP.

1.1 Statement of the Problem

HRE researchers strongly recommend that HR concepts as enunciated in numerous declarations and conventions of UNO; and in all constitutions of the states among the nation states need to be part of curricula and imparted to the learners in formal settings of educations in all alma maters through key textbooks. However, compulsory textbooks like English in all types of education systems in Pakistan are significantly lacking HR concepts. Therefore, the aim of this content analysis study was to explore civil rights as mentioned in the UDHR as well in CP in the textbooks of English in SSC and 'O' Level in KP.

1.2 Objective

- To explore civil rights in the subject of English Textbooks in SSC versus 'O' Level

1.3 Research Question

- To what extent civil rights are found in English Textbooks in SSC versus 'O' Level?

1.4 Sub- research Questions

- To what extent the sub-categories of civil rights are available in English Textbooks in SSC versus 'O' Level?
- To what extent the issues and their positive as well as negative directions pertaining to civil rights are available in English Textbooks in SSC versus 'O' Level?

1.5 Delimitations

The study was delimited to:

- Explore HR as mentioned in UDHR as well as CP. Thus, this research endeavor delimits itself to UDHR and CP as being key areas of interest and concern to be explored.
- English language in both SSC versus 'O' Level is having paramount significance in teaching and learning process across schools in KP. Therefore, the researchers have delimited the study up to English Reading Book for Class 10th and Oxford Progressive English (Revised Edition) by Rachel Redford Textbooks only.
- Exploring all fundamental HR mentioned in UDHR and CP were beyond the scope of the study. Hence, this research investigation was further specifically delimited to civil rights within the contents of English Textbooks of both streams.

1.6 Significance of the Study

The findings of this research endeavor should yield an important contribution to the high value information it will denote about the extent of civil rights in English Textbook at SSC and 'O' Level. In addition, this work will also generate fresh insight into the minds of the concerned officials and in charge of curricula in SSC and 'O' Level textbooks across KP to further include HR concepts pragmatically and on sound footings at secondary level. Furthermore, it is hoped that this research will contribute to a deeper understanding of the already existed civil rights in both textbooks of English language. Moreover, curriculum planners and designers of 'O' Level English in Cambridge International Examinations (*to be read as CIE in this article*) are drawn to the significance of giving due heed to HR concepts in all textbooks particularly of social sciences for the secondary students during the process of development or amendment in the near future. Above all, this exploratory investigation also equally offers fresh perspective for the future researchers to carry out similar studies that are supporting and complementing it.

1.7 Assumptions

In conducting this study, the following assumptions were made.

- The researchers would obtain rich and thick data pertaining to civil rights from the selected texts in English Textbooks of both streams of SSC and 'O' Level.
- The data collection instrument which was based on the modified version of Shukla' Model (2011) could be easily replicated in context of the present study for exploring civil rights as given in UDHR and CP.

2. Methodology

2.1 Research Design

Research is considered as an organized attempt for the purpose of exploring new knowledge. Hence, proper and careful planning is inevitable before embarking upon any research endeavor. The way a designer prepares plans for his scheme on paper, in the same manner a researcher is supposed to plan or design his research (Shukla, 2011). The present study under investigation was a qualitative study based on content analysis approach in nature that explored civil rights as stated in UDHR as well as CP of Pakistan in SSC versus ‘O’ Level English Textbooks in KP.

2.1 Population

Fraenkel and Wallen (2012) have termed population to be a larger group to which the investigator hopes to apply the results. Hence, population of the study in both the streams consisted of all the units with all the pages of both textbooks of English. Therefore, the results of the study were to be generalized (Fraenkel & Wallen, 2012; Sarswat, 2016) to the Textbooks of English in both the streams of SSC and ‘O’ Level.

Table 1: Population of the Study

SSC English Reading Book for Class 10 th	Oxford Progressive English(Revised Edition) by Rachel Redford
Total Units 13	Total Units 10
Total Pages 167	Total pages 174

Table 1 above illustrates an overview of the accessible population. The SSC English Textbook contained 13 units and 167 pages. On the other hand, the population of Oxford Progressive English comprised 10 units having 174 pages in total.

2.2 Sample

Although the universe of the accessible text [of both the Textbooks of English for SSC and ‘O’ Level] was too large to be examined altogether, therefore, the researchers had to limit their approach to a manageable body of the texts (Krippendorff, 2004). Since, it was a qualitative study based on content analysis approach, the researchers adopted convenient and purposive sampling. More specifically, one of the most significant reasons for the selection of these two particular textbooks was that the principal investigator of the study himself has been teaching English language in both the streams. Besides, English language is a window to the whole world which occupies key status in the present international scenario (Shukla, 2011).

Table 2: Selected Sample of SSC English Reading Book for Class 10th

Chapter/ Unit/Lesson	Total Pages	Total Paragraphs	Total Sentences	Total Sentences Selected	Total Sentences Dropped
Unit 1: <i>The last address of the Holy Prophet Muhammad (Sal-Allah-u- Alahie Waalehis Wasallam)</i>	02	06	33	22	11
Unit 05: <i>Begum Rana Liaqat Ali Khan</i>	04	12	45	45	Zero
Total= 02	06	18	78	67	11

It can be indicated from Table 2 that the researchers selected “*The Last Address of the Holy Prophet (PBUH)*” and, “*Begum Rana Liaqat Ali Khan*” as purposive sample units from English Reading Book for Class 10th which was published by KP Textbook Board, Peshawar for the Session 2019 and 2020. The sampled units comprised of 6 pages with altogether 18 paragraphs. There were 78 sentences in total. However, only 67 sentences were chosen by

the researchers which were explicitly denoting HR. On the contrary, 11 sentences were considered to be redundant for HR concepts and were dropped eventually.

Table 3: Selected Sample of ‘O’ Level Oxford Progressive English by Rachel Redford

Chapter/ Unit/Lesson	Total Pages	Total Paragraphs	Total Sentences	Total Sentences Selected	Total Sentences Dropped
1. <i>Kaleidoscopes on Wheels</i> written by Rachel Redford	03	08	46	26	20
<i>Lesson No: 03 Early Days</i> written and edited by Imran Ahmad	02	05	51	24	27
Total= 02	05	13	97	50	47

Table 3 suggests that the researchers selected conveniently and purposively, “*Kaleidoscopes on Wheels*” written by Rachel Redford and “*Early Days*” which was written and edited by Imran Ahmad from the prescribed textbook called as, “*Oxford Progressive English*” for ‘O’ Levels. The chosen units comprised 05 pages, having 13 paragraphs and 97 sentences in toto. The researchers chose only 50 sentences indicating HR concepts and dropped 47 sentences considered to be irrelevant for exploring HR.

2.3 Data Collection Tool

As has been highlighted by (Berg, 2001) in his thorough study of content analysis, various procedures are employed by qualitative researchers while analyzing the data. Hoisir (1968, p. 608 cited in Berg, 2001) observed content analysis as a technique which is used for drawing inferences by systematically and objectively identifying special characteristics of messages. Furthermore, Krippendorff (2004) in his comprehensive and landmark study on content analysis has also emphasized that it is one of the most significant techniques currently in vogue in social sciences research. Consequently, data were collected by researchers through content analysis procedure by applying one of the most well-known models of Shukla (2011) which has also been adopted by (Abouzar et.al, 2020) in their most recent research study.

Table 4: Modified version of the Model of Shukla (2011) for data collection

Name	Nature	Total
Main Category	Civil rights	01
Sub- categories	Right to Life, Right to Liberty, Right to Personal Security, Right to Equality	04
Articles selected from UDHR	Article 1, Article 2, Article 3, , Article5, Article 7, Article 12	06
Articles selected from CP	Article 9, Article 10, Article 10 A, Article 11, Article 12, Article 13, Article 14	07
Issues selected from CP and UDHR with Articles mentioned	[CP Article 9]Security of a Person, [CP Article 10] Safeguards in Arrest and Detention, [CP Article 10 A] Fair trail, [CP Article 11] Slavery, [CP Article 12] Retrospective punishment, [CP Article 13] Self – incrimination, [CP Article 14] Dignity, [UDHR Article 5] Torture and Degrading Treatment, [UDHR Article 12] Interference with Privacy, Family, Home and Correspondence,[UHDR Article 2]Religious Issues, Race, Cast , Gender, Freedom from Discrimination, [CP Article 25] Right to equality before the law	11

Directions	Positive: The given sentence denotes the fulfillment of HR	01
	Negative : The given sentence stands for HR violation	01
Unit of Analysis	One complete sentence used as text	

Table 4 shows modified version of the model of data collection instrument of Shukla (2011). The researchers selected only 01 main category of civil rights which is having 04 sub- categories of right to life, right to liberty, right to personal security and right to equality. The main category of civil rights and its sub- categories along with 11 key issues were selected from the articles of UDHR which were 08 altogether and having resemblance with the chosen articles of the CP of Pakistan that were found to be 04 in total. The fulfillment of the HR in the selected sentences denoted positive direction. On the contrary, the negative direction meant for violation of the fundamental rights coupled with the unit of analysis which was one complete sentence from the chosen samples.

3. Data Analysis

Table 5: Main Category of Civil according to UDHR and CP

SSC English Reading Book for Class 10th			‘O’ Level English Textbook	
Main- category	f	%	f	%
Civil rights	39	81.25 %	09	18.75%

Table 5 presents a comparative analysis of civil rights mentioned in UDHR and CP in the textbooks of SSC versus ‘O’ Level English. It was found that civil rights mentioned in SSC English Textbook were f= 39 with = 18.25 % out of total= 48 which was > than ‘O’ Level English having f= 09 with= 18.75 %. For this reason, it was inferred that civil rights existed more in SSC English Textbook in contrast to ‘O’ Level.

In the list below are the excerpts from both the textbooks which denote the main categories of civil rights implicitly.

- “No murders committed during the days of ignorance (jahiliyyat) are to be avenged” (SSC English, 2019/2020, p. 3).
- “Initially, when he was alive, Liaqat Ali Khan himself defended his wife in public” (SSC English, 2019/2020, p. 55).
- “I do have a growing awareness of being different: both foreign and not Christian” (‘O’ Level Oxford Progressive English, p. 1).
- “They also embrace East and West, the secular and the sacred, the ancient and the modern” (‘O’ Level Oxford Progressive English, p. 23).

Table 6: Sub-categories of Civil according to UDHR

SSC English Textbook			‘O’ Level English Textbook	
Sub-categories	f	%	f	%
Right to Life [UDHR Article 3]	03	7.69 %	00	00%
Liberty [UDHR Article 3]	00	00%	00	00%
Personal Security [UDHR Article 3]	00	00%	00	00%
Right to Equality[UDHR, Article1]	36	92.30%	09	100%
Total	39	100%	09	100%

Results obtained from the comparative analysis of both SSC and ‘O’ level English textbooks are presented in Table 6. Data revealed that the sub- categories of civil rights as derived from UDHR were right to life, liberty, personal

security and equality. However, right to equality was found to be more which was followed by right to life accordingly in both SSC versus ‘O’ level English textbooks. Data also denoted that right to equality mentioned in SSC English Textbook was f= 36 with= 92.30% out of total= 39 which was > than ‘O’ Level English Textbook having f= 09 with= 100%. Resultantly, it was concluded that right to equality was found more in SSC English Textbook as compared to ‘O’ Level English Textbook.

Expressions given in both SSC and ‘O’ Level English Textbooks in sub-categories of right to equality included are as follow:

- *“There is no preference for the Arab over the non- Arab or the non- Arab over the Arab” (SSC English, 2019/2020, p.3).*
- *“Initially, when he was alive, Liaqat Ali Khan himself defended his wife in public”(SSC English, 2019/2020, p.55).*
- *“They are all of ages and races”(‘O’ Level Oxford Progressive English, p.31).*
- *“They also embrace East and West, the secular and the sacred, the ancient and the modern” (‘O’ Level Oxford Progressive English, p.23).*

Table 7: Issues related to Civil rights according to UDHR and CP

SSC English Textbook			‘O’ Level English Textbook	
	f	%	f	%
Security of a Person [CP Article 9]	00	00%	00	00%
Safeguards in Arrest and Detention [CP Article 10]	00	00%	00	00%
Fair trail[CP10 A]	00	00%	00	00%
Slavery [CP11]	00	00%	00	00%
Retrospective punishment [CP 12]	00	00%	00	00%
Self – incrimination [CP 13]	00	00%	00	00%
Dignity[CP 14]	00	00%	00	00%
Torture and Degrading Treatment[UDHR Article5]	01	2.56 %	00	00%
Interference with Privacy, Family, Home and Correspondence [UDHR Article 12]	00	00%	00	00%
Religious Issues [UDHR Article 2]	02	5.12 %	00	00%
Race [UDHR Article 2]	03	7.69 %	09	100 %
Cast [UDHR Article 2]	00	00%	00	00%
Gender [UDHR Article 2]	33	84.61 %	00	00%
Freedom from Discrimination [UDHR Article 2]	00	00%	00	00%
Right to equality before the law [UDHR Article 7]	00	00 %	00	00%
Total	39	100%	09	100%

It can be seen from the data in Table 7 that the researchers selected 15 clauses pertaining to the issues of civil rights from UDHR and CP. The analysis of the data denoted that the issue of gender in SSC English textbook was f= 33 with= 84.61% out of total= 39 which was > than ‘O’ Level English Textbook with f= 00 having= 00% out of 09. While the issue of race in ‘O’ Level English Textbook with f= 09 with= 100 % out of= 09 which was > than SSC English Textbook with f= 03 with= 7.69% out of = 39. Hence, it can be deduced from the data that issue of gender was given much attention in SSC Textbook in the selected sample in contrast to ‘O’ Level English Textbook. However, the issue of race was greater in ‘O’ Level English Textbook as in contrast to SSC English.

Regarding the key issues of race and gender, it is seen that the following statements are included in the sampled lessons of both the textbooks of SSC versus ‘O’ Level in order to raise awareness about the sub- category of right to equality as an important civil right:

- “You have rights over your wives and your wives have rights over you” (SSC English, 2019/2020, p.3).
- “Her first opportunity to organize Muslim women presented itself in the same year, when she formed a small volunteer corps for nursing and first laid in Delhi”(SSC English, 2019/2020, p.55).
- “I notice that the black boy has a very cunning simile as the two of them walk away with all of my Tarzan cards” (‘O’ Level Oxford Progressive English, p. 31).
- “The black boy examines the two cards and then declares the winner” (‘O’ Level Oxford Progressive English, p.31).

Table8: Directions related to civil rights according to UDHR and CP

SSC English Textbook				‘O’ Level English Textbook	
Civil Rights	Directions	f	%	f	%
	Positives	38	97.43%	02	22.22%
	Negatives	01	2.56%	07	77.77%
Total		39	100 %	09	100%

Table 8 showed positive as well as negative directions of civil rights in SSC and ‘O’ Level English textbooks. The comparative analysis of data revealed that positive directions of civil rights in SSC English textbook was f= 38 with= 97.43% out of total= 39 which was > than ‘O’ level textbook having f= 02 with = 22.22% out of total= 09. On the other hand, it was deduced from the data the negative directions of civil rights in ‘O’ level was f= 07 with = 77.77% out of total= 09 which was > than SSC English Textbook with f= 01 with = 2.56% out of total= 39. Hence, it could be inferred from the data that civil rights in SSC English Textbook were presented positively more in contrast to ‘O’ level English textbook. However, negative projection of civil rights along with sub- categories and issues in ‘O’ level textbook was found more in comparison to SSC textbook.

There were some positive and negative illustrations about civil rights in both textbooks which are as under:

- *Main category: civil right; sub-category: equality; issue: race; direction: positive*
 “Do not forget that every Muslim should be truly a brother to every true Muslim” (SSC English, 2019/2020, p.3).
- *Main category: civil right; sub-category: right to equality; issue: gender discrimination; direction: negative*
 “During this point in Pakistan’s history there weren’t many nurses in Karachi, so Begum Liaqat asked the army to train women to give injections and first aid”(SSC English, 2019/2020, p.55).
- *Main category: civil right; sub-category: equality; issue: race; direction: Negative*
 “The black boy is orchestrating the game; the white boy is the other contestant” (‘O’ Level Oxford Progressive English, p. 31).
- *Main category: civil right; sub- category: right to equality; issues: racial discrimination ; direction: positive*
 “They also embrace East and West, the secular and the sacred, the ancient and the modern” (‘O’ Level Oxford Progressive English, p.23).

4. Discussion

This study set out with the aim of exploring civil rights according to the selected clauses of UDHR and CP in the Textbooks of English in SSC and ‘O’ Level in KP. The most obvious finding to emerge from the analysis is that civil rights existed more in SSC English Textbook in contrast to ‘O’ Level. This rather contradictory result may be due to the fact that the selected lessons which were based on the purposive and convenient sample included most of the concepts of civil rights and their sub-categories of rights to life and rights to equality and the issues of gender, racial and religious discrimination in contra to ‘O’ Level. Nevertheless, this result corroborates the finding possibly up to a greater extent of the previous work of (Alhawamdeh, 2023; Nordin, S.Z. 2010).

It is also pertinent to bring to the limelight that content analysis approach carries with it various well known limitations. Bradford and Cullen (2017) in this respect stated in the edited version of their book on research methodology that predetermined categories are restrictive in nature, while; the researchers construct the codes by themselves and not by the authors or audiences. Similarly, critics like (Fraenkel & Wallen, 2012) have argued that

content analysis is not only restricted in analysis of communication but establishing validity in this approach is also difficult. One major drawback of content analysis as pointed out by Berg (2001) is that it is not effective for testing causal relationship between variables. Besides, contributing dramatically visible progress by the content analysts; they, nevertheless, have failed to meet the challenges of current era (Krippendorff, 2004). Furthermore, many writers for example (Manimozhi & Srinivasan, 2018) have challenged this approach claiming on the ground that a lot of time is required in content analysis by the analysts. Hence, it is a time consuming method.

Another unique but surprisingly interesting findings are that the sub-categories of right to life and equality were found to be more in SSC English as compared to 'O' Level. Likewise, gender and religious issues existed more in SSC in contrast to 'O' Level English. On the contrary, analysis of the data revealed that the issue of race was given less weightage in SSC English textbook than 'O' Level. Several factors could explain this observation. For instance, the curriculum designers of both SSC and 'O' Level English Textbook have given preference to right to life, equality; gender, race and religious issues that broadly support the work of (Munir, 2021).

4.1 Limitations of the Study

The generalizability of the results of the study is subject to certain limitations. For instance, the application of convenient and purposive small sample size restricted the researchers up to the selection of two lessons each from the sampled books. Therefore, the researchers were unable to go through both textbooks extensively since it could take a lot time. Hence, critical analysis of the whole contents was overlooked. Likewise, data should have been processed through the latest software of NVIVO. However, due to lack of accessibility to the particular software of qualitative data, results were analyzed manually by the researchers. Notwithstanding these limitations, the study certainly adds to our understanding of the fundamental civil rights and key issues of rights to life, liberty, personal security, equality, religion, race and cast in the context of both SSC and 'O' Level education.

4.2 Implications

The present study has many methodological, theoretical and policy implications.

First, Shukla' Model(2011) for data collection was modified and replicated in the context of comparative study in the budding area of research in HRE by analyzing the contents of English Textbooks across SSC and 'O' Level Streams. The methodological approach of the study may be applied to other comparative studies of textbooks in different context at different levels of education elsewhere in the world.

Secondly, the present study appears to be the first of its kind to compare SSC versus 'O' Level English Textbooks in KP in the context of exploring civil rights under the umbrella of selected clauses of UDHR and fundamental rights mentioned in the CP in the cutting-edge area of HRE research. Hence, being novel in its theoretical lens, it may further open new vistas for investigating other overlooked dimensions of economic, cultural and political rights in comparative content analysis of English Textbooks at secondary level across the province of KP.

Thirdly, the insights gained from this study may be of assistance to the policy makers, curriculum experts, curriculum planners and curriculum designers of textbook boards at SSC Level and that of CIE System in focusing on a balanced approach to include all the generations of HR while redesigning the textbooks of English language in future.

4.3 Future Research

Keeping in view the results, findings and discussion of the study, the researchers call for carrying out future studies on exploring HR at HSSC versus 'A' Level across regional and national contexts. Additionally, this study was limited to SSC and 'O' Level but could be extended for further comparative studies on the SSC versus religious seminaries (*Deeni Maadris*) due to strongly embedded multi-layered education system across the province. Likewise, further research in this field would be possibly of great help in taking into consideration cultural, political and economic rights mentioned implicitly in UDHR in other levels of education coupled with the textbooks of Urdu, Islamiyat, Pak study across both the streams and Pashto language as a mother tongue at SSC level in particular. More broadly, a greater focus on other key aspirations of the UN like CRC could produce interesting findings that account more for mixed method approaches and further quantitative and qualitative studies with large probability and non- probability sampling. Furthermore, the findings also suggest several courses of action for paying particular attention by the curricula designers and planners of textbook board and the British Council to key HR issues of rights to equality, race, gender and religious discrimination.

5. Conclusion

In this investigation, the aim was to explore civil rights by taking into consideration the key document of UDHR and fundamental rights in the CP. This study delimited itself to the content analysis of English Textbooks in SSC and 'O' Level in the Province of KP. The overall results of this qualitative research endeavor revealed that civil rights and right to equality were found more in SSC English Textbook instead of 'O' Level. However, more interestingly the issue of gender was given much weightage in SSC Textbook as compared to 'O' Level English Textbook. On the other hand, the issue of race was greater in 'O' Level English Textbook contrary to SSC English. Therefore, it can be clearly stated that positive directions of civil rights in SSC English textbook were presented positively more in contrast to 'O' level English textbook. Additionally, the findings from this study make several contributions to the current literature. First and foremost, the methodological approach adopted in this exploratory study may be useful in other comparative studies of textbooks in different context at different levels of education. Hence, further studies need to be carried out at HSSC versus 'A' Level across regional and national contexts and SSC versus religious seminaries (*Deeni Maadris*) on HR due to heterogeneous education system in the province. Secondly, the insights gained from this study may be of assistance to researchers to conduct future studies on economic, cultural and political rights as given in UDHR in other levels of education in key textbooks of Urdu, Islamiyat, Pak study in both the streams. Last but not the least, the implications of the study may be of paramount importance to the policy makers, curriculum experts, curriculum planners and curriculum designers of textbook boards at SSC Level and that of CIE to include all generations of HR during the review process of the textbooks of English language in future.

References

- Abouzar, Shehzad, S & Ali, R. (2020). *The Content Analysis of Class 10th English Text Book in Post Conflict Peace Building Process in District Swat*. International Review of Social Sciences (IRSS)
- Abu Al-Dabaat, M. (2019) Concepts of Human Rights In Islamic Education Textbooks At The Higher Basic Stage of Education In Jordan. *Journal of Educational Science Studies-University of Jordan*, 49(1), Pp. 139-153.
- Ahmad, J. M. (2018). Incorporation of Social and Moral Values through Secondary School Curriculum: A Content Analysis. (PhD Thesis) Department of Education Hazara University Mansehra Pakistan.
- Alhawamdeh, H. A. (2023). Inclusion of Human Rights Concepts in Arabic Textbooks for the secondary Stage in Saudi Arabia: Teachers' perspective. *Journal of Southwest Jiaotong University*, 58(1).
- Al-Omari, M., & Ali, A. (2019) A suggested conception of the Islamic education curricula, the system of general program courses in the light of human rights. *Journal of Educational and Psychological Sciences*, 30(14), pp. 47-70
- Aslan, C., & Karaman-Kepeneci, Y. (2008). Human rights education: A comparison of mother tongue textbooks in Turkey and France.
- Assembly, U. G. (1948). Universal declaration of human rights. *UN General Assembly*, 302(2), 14-25.
- Bashir, H. (2016) Human rights: concept, historical development and categories. *The Egyptian Journal of International Law: The Egyptian Society of International Law*, 72, pp. 430-484.
- Berg, B. L. (2001). *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences*. Allyn & Bacon.
- Bradford, S. & Cullen, F. (2017). *Research and Research Methods for Youth Practitioners*. Routledge Taylor and Francis Group.
- Damyanti, N., Nurazizah, S. A., Fitriansyah, R. A., & Muhyi, A. A. (2024). The Concept of Human Rights from The Qur'an Perspective. *Bulletin of Islamic Research*, 2(1), 17-32.
- De Kort, F. (2017). Human rights education in social studies in the Netherlands: A case study textbook analysis. *Prospects*, 47(1), 55-71.
- Donnelly, J., & Whelan, D. J. (2020). *International human rights*. Routledge.
- Fraenkel, J. R., Wallen, N. E., & Hyun, H. H. (2012). *How to design and evaluate research in education* (Vol. 7, p. 429). New York: McGraw-hill.
- Gay, L. R., Mills, G. E., & Airasian, P. W. (2011). *Educational research: Competencies for analysis and applications*. Pearson Higher Ed.
- Heumann, C., & Shalabh, M. S. (2016). *Introduction to statistics and data analysis*. Springer.
- Ishfaq, U., Tahir, T., & Tariq, M. (2014). Parents Perception about O-level and A-level Education System in Pakistan. *J. Appl. Environ. Biol. Sci*, 4(9S), 348-352.
- Karim, H. (2019) Human rights. Cairo: Dar Al-Nibras for printing and publishing. [14] AL-D

- Kaya, K. (2019). Comparison of Seventh-Grade Turkish and Iranian Social Studies Textbooks in Terms of Value Education. *Educational Research and Reviews*, 14(17), 595-607.
- Kothari, C. R. (2004). *Research methodology: Methods and techniques*. New Age International.
- Krippendorff, K. (2004). Reliability in content analysis: Some common misconceptions and recommendations. *Human communication research*, 30(3), 411-433.
- Krippendorff, K. (2018). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology*. Sage publications.
- Kukovec, M. (2017). Human rights education in foreign language learning. *ELOPE: English Language Overseas Perspectives and Enquiries*, 14(1), 13-24.
- Manimozhi, G., & Srinivasan, P. (2018). A meta synthesis of content analysis approaches. *Amer. J. Educ. Res*, 6, 632-637.
- Mukhoyyaroh, M. (2019). Hak asasi manusia dalam kehidupan sosial dalam perspektif Al-Qur'an. *Jurnal Studi Al-Qur'an*, 15(2), 219-234.
- Munir, A. (2021). Global Citizenship Education: A Comparative Analysis of O- Levels, A levels, Secondary School And Higher Secondary School Curriculum. (PhD Thesis) Department of STEM Education Faculty of Education, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore.
- Nordin, S.Z. (2010). Human Rights Education in England and Malaysia: Faith and Secular Schools' Knowledge and Practice (Doctoral Dissertation). University of Exeter
- Pakistan, & Pakistan. National Assembly. (1973). *The constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan*. Manager of Publications.
- Pirzado, P. A. (2022). Teachers' understandings and practices in teaching human rights concepts in Pakistani schools (Doctoral dissertation). University of Technology Sydney Faculty of Arts and Social Science.
- Rahmawati, L. (2018). *A content analysis of the English textbook " Primary English as a Second Language"* (Doctoral dissertation, UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya).
- Rezeq, K. A. K. A. (2016). *An Analytical Study of Human Rights Principles in English for Palestine Textbooks*, (Unpublished master Thesis), The Islamic University, Gaza.
- Rezeq, K. A. K. A. (2022). Evaluating the Palestinian's English as a Foreign Language (EFL) Textbooks of the Secondary Stage Using Textbooks Evaluation Standards. *Journal of Educational Sciences-Qatar University*, 20(20).
- Saraswat, S. (2016). *Methodology of Educational Research: MA [Education Second Semester] EDCN-801C*.
- Schreier, M. (2012). Qualitative content analysis in practice.
- Shukla, T. (2011). *A study of selected textbooks with reference to Human Rights and its Educational Implications* (Doctoral dissertation, Ganpat University).
- Smith, S. (2021). Exploring the Inclusion of Human Rights Themes within Citizenship Education Curricula. (Master Degree Thesis). Department of Education, Stockholm University, Sweden.
- Tehseem, T., Bokhari, Z., & Zulfiqar, S. (2020). Human rights education and language learning in Pakistan: An EFL perspective. *Journal of Education and Educational Development*, 7(2).
- Uddin, M. F., Osmani, N. M., & Jamil, K. H. (2023). The "Right to Life" in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR): A comparative study between the UDHR and the Qur'an and Sunnah. *UMRAN-Journal of Islamic and Civilizational Studies*, 10(3), 41-55.